

**To:** schroederjc@niehs.nih.gov[schroederjc@niehs.nih.gov]  
**Cc:** booker@niehs.nih.gov[booker@niehs.nih.gov];  
martynts@berkeley.edu[martynts@berkeley.edu]; Cogliano, Vincent[cogliano.vincent@epa.gov]; Fritz,  
Jason[Fritz.Jason@epa.gov]; 'Bernard Stewart'[Bernard.Stewart@SESHS.HEALTH.NSW.GOV.AU];  
Caldwell, Jane[Caldwell.Jane@epa.gov]; Kavlock, Robert[Kavlock.Robert@epa.gov]; 'Paul  
Lambert'[plambert@wisc.edu]; DeMarini, David[DeMarini.David@epa.gov];  
bucher@niehs.nih.gov[bucher@niehs.nih.gov]; 'Chris Portier'[cportier@me.com]; Gibbons,  
Catherine[Gibbons.Catherine@epa.gov]; 'Kate Guyton'[GuytonK@iarc.fr];  
lambert@oncology.wisc.edu[lambert@oncology.wisc.edu]; hecht002@umn.edu[hecht002@umn.edu];  
'Robert Baan'[BaanR@iarc.fr]; 'Kurt Straif'[straifk@iarc.fr]; 'Rusyn, Ivan'[IRusyn@cvm.tamu.edu]  
**From:** Martyn Smith  
**Sent:** Fri 11/13/2015 4:03:36 AM  
**Subject:** RE: Provisional Acceptance: EHP 15-09912-REV-Smith  
[1509912REV-Smith-Separate-Comments\\_response.docx](#)  
[Key-Characteristics-of-Carcinogens-11-12-15.pdf](#)  
[Key-Characteristics-of-Carcinogens-11-12-15.docx](#)  
[Key-Characteristics-of-Carcinogens-11-11-15.pdf](#)  
[Key-Characteristics-of-Carcinogens-11-11-15.docx](#)  
[1509912Rev-Figure 4.pdf](#)  
[1509912Rev-Figure 3.pdf](#)  
[1509912Rev-Figure 2.pdf](#)  
[1509912rev-Fig1.pdf](#)

Dear Dr. Schroeder

We have attempted below to respond to all your editorial comments. We thank you for your careful review of our manuscript. It is now much improved and we hope ready for publication. I attach a number of files as requested:

- 1) A word document responding to your separate comments. Responses are shown in track changes.
- 2) A copy of the revised manuscript dated 11-11-15 in both word and pdf formats (2 files) showing all of the changes made in tracked changes
- 3) A clean copy of the revised manuscript dated 11-12-15 with all changes accepted in both word and pdf formats (2 files)
- 4) 4 separate files of the Figures in pdf format.

Thank you again for the careful consideration of our work. Please don't hesitate to contact me should you need anything else.

With best regards,

Martyn Smith

Martyn T. Smith, Ph.D.  
Professor & Director, Superfund Research Program,  
Division of Environmental Health Sciences, School of Public Health  
Li Ka Shing Center  
University of California  
Berkeley, California 94720-7360  
(510) 642-8770 tel / (510) 642-0427 fax  
(510) 334-1222 (cell)  
(510) 643-5100 (assistant)  
email: martynts@berkeley.edu  
Web: <http://www.martyntsmith.com>

---

This message and its attachments are strictly confidential. If you are not the intended recipient of this

message, please immediately notify the sender and delete it. Since its integrity cannot be guaranteed, its content cannot involve the sender's responsibility. Any misuse, any disclosure or publication of its content, either whole or partial, is prohibited, exception made of formally approved use.

-----

-----Original Message-----

From: onbehalfof+schroederjc+niehs.nih.gov@manuscriptcentral.com  
[mailto:onbehalfof+schroederjc+niehs.nih.gov@manuscriptcentral.com] On Behalf Of  
schroederjc@niehs.nih.gov  
Sent: Sunday, November 08, 2015 9:48 AM  
To: martynts@berkeley.edu  
Cc: schroederjc@niehs.nih.gov; booker@niehs.nih.gov  
Subject: Provisional Acceptance: EHP 15-09912-REV-Smith

08-Nov-2015

15-09912-REV.R1 - Key Characteristics of Carcinogens as a Basis for Organizing Data on Mechanisms of Carcinogenesis

Dear Dr. Smith:

Your paper has been provisionally accepted for publication in Environmental Health Perspectives, pending your response to the questions indicated on the "Separate Comments" file attached to this email.

In your response, we ask that you:

- Indicate all proposed changes on the attached draft of your manuscript using the Microsoft Word tracking feature.
- Return the tracked copy along with two clean versions of the main text file: one Microsoft Word file and one PDF file.
- Provide separate files, if needed, for revised figures.
- Provide a separate letter to explain major changes and to respond to questions or requests from EHP.

In addition, carefully review your paper for errors, and confirm that your coauthors are fully satisfied with the manuscript before returning your revised files. Please pay special attention to the following problems, which we find are particularly likely to be spotted at this stage:

- Units of measure are incorrect.
- Author names are missing, incorrect, or out of order.
- Author affiliations are incorrect or incomplete.
- Footnotes are missing in the body or legend of a table.
- Figures are incorrect (e.g., wrong graph) or incomplete (e.g., missing axis labels).

This will be your last opportunity to make changes to your manuscript and its accompanying materials before Advance Publication, so please be sure it is correct and complete before sending your response.

Email your files directly to me by replying to this message. We will review your revised files and respond within 5 working days to confirm that your paper is ready for final acceptance.

After final acceptance your paper will be published online as an Advance Publication with a permanent DOI number for citation purposes. EHP staff will copyedit your manuscript within approximately 8-12 weeks. You will receive page proofs for your review before final publication in a monthly issue.

NOTE: If you or your institution plan to issue a press release for this article, please contact Susan Booker (booker@niehs.nih.gov) as soon as possible to discuss EHP's embargo policy.

Please confirm receipt of this email and contact me promptly if you have questions or will be unable to respond by 17 November 2015. Your timely response will expedite final acceptance of your paper.

Best Regards,

Jane Schroeder

Jane C. Schroeder, DVM MPH PhD  
Science Editor, Environmental Health Perspectives DHHS, NIH, NIEHS  
email: schroederjc@niehs.nih.gov  
<http://www.ehponline.org>